

# Minutes of the PHIN Annual General Meeting 6 December 2021 (PB2145)

Location: Online meeting via Microsoft Teams

Chair: [Andrew Vallance-Owen](#)

## Attendees

<b>Member Representatives</b>	
Rob Anderson	Aspen Healthcare
Susannah Nunn	Aspen Healthcare
Doug Wright	Aviva
Annabel Bentley	AXA PPP Healthcare
Ayodele Kazeem	AXA PPP Healthcare
Dr Robin Clark	Bupa UK
Helen Hartley	Bupa UK
Liz Adair	Circle Health
David Anderson	Circle Health
Shane Cobb	Circle Health
Rosemary Hittinger	Federation of Independent Practitioner Organisations
Richard Packard	Federation of Independent Practitioner Organisations
Cliff Bucknall	HCA International
Saba Anjum	Healthcare Management Trust
Lorcan Sheppard	Healthcare Management Trust
Elin Richardson	Horder Healthcare
Andrew Gallini	Hospital Of St John And St Elizabeth
Caroline Smith	Nuffield Health
Wouter VanDenBrande	Nuffield Health
Vivienne Heckford	Ramsay Health Care UK
Jo Jenner	Spencer Private Hospitals Ltd
Cathy Cale	Spire Healthcare
Daniel Verster	The New Victoria Hospital Limited
Lance Drake	The New Victoria Hospital Limited
David Marshall	The New Victoria Hospital Limited
Tracy Norton	Vitality Health
Brian Goodman	Western Provident Association
Ben Marshall	Great Ormond Street Hospital for Children NHS Foundation Trust
Hamza Najib	Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Teresa McHugh	Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
James Rainsley	Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Anton Robinson	Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust



Andrew Barker	Phoenix Healthcare
Souhayla Madarbukus	Phoenix Healthcare
Daljit Panesar	Royal Brompton & Harefield NHS Foundation Trust
Christine Mozzamdar	The Hospital Group

<b>PHIN Directors</b>	
Andrew Vallance-Owen	Chair
Jayne Scott	NED/Vice Chair
Professor Sir Cyril Chantler	NED
Don Grocott	NED
Michael Hutchings	NED
Matt James	CEO
Nigel Mercer	NED
Hugh Savill	NED (Observer)
Professor Sir Norman Williams	NED

<b>Non-Voting Guests</b>	
Charlotte Alfrey	Metro HR
George Brenton	Competition & Markets Authority
David Hare	IHPN
Peter Hill	Competition & Markets Authority
Neil Huband	Private Patients Forum
Graham Kendall	IHPN
Susannah Meeke	Competition & Markets Authority
Shannon Newman	Healthcode Ltd
Mark Sherlock	Brebners
Richard Steele	NHS Digital
Sally Taber	ISCAS

<b>PHIN Staff – In Attendance</b>	
Paulo Arana	Health Data Analyst
Xeno Archarya	Head of Insights & Analytics
Jubril Balogun	Quality Assurance Analyst
Philip Beicken	Project Manager
Jessica Belfield	BI Analyst
Chloe Camu	Scrum Master & Informatics Coordinator
Jonathan Evans	Communication Manager
Chryzan Fernandes	BI Analyst
Jon Fistein	Chief Medical Officer
Aleksander Gould	Office Manager/EA to Matt James
Jack Griffin	Finance & Commercial Director
Ellie Griffiths	Account Manager
Jessica Harcourt	Clerk
Nadine Jones	Engagement Team Administrator
Oliver Lee	Data Quality Analyst
Lea McMahon	Product Manager
David Minton	Chief Technology Officer
Patrick Palmer	Information Consultant
James Parmley	Software Development Manager
Ben Serethy	Data Protection Officer
Mona Shah	Director of People & Process (Company Secretary)
Greg Swarbrick	Strategic Projects Lead

## Minutes of the Meeting

At 1.03pm Dr Andrew Vallance-Owen, the PHIN Chair, opened the formal meeting and welcomed all attendees.

No objections were raised to the recording of the meeting and the Chair advised the attendees that the recording and the question-and-answer sections of the meeting would be published on the PHIN website.

The Chair was pleased to welcome the following people:

Susannah Meeke, George Brenton and Peter Hill from the CMA  
David Hare, CEO of IHPN  
Sally Taber, CEO of ISCAS  
Richard Steele, Programme Head at NHS Digital  
David Middleton, Executive Chair of the Association of Medical Insurers & Intermediaries

Hugh Savill, the private medical insurers nominee to the PHIN Board, was attending as an observer and his first official Board Meeting would be in February 2022.

The Chair advised that this would be his last AGM. In March 2021 he had advised the PHIN Board that, having had nearly 10 years in office, he intended to announce his retirement at the AGM. The sector, supported by PHIN, had made significant progress over this period but, 7 years after the publication of the CMA Order, there remained much to do. The Order was not primarily about Providers, consultants, insurers or even about PHIN, it was about the patients and consumers who, increasingly, were using, and thinking of using the private sector and needed a reliable information source.

The original referral from the Office of Fair Trading in 2012 stated that there was a need to make “easily comparable information available to patients and their GPs on the quality and costs of private healthcare services”, and the CMA Order set out to deliver that requirement. PHIN was the only source of data-based comparable information on quality performance in the sector. The healthcare professionals amongst the attendees knew that anecdotal reports from individual patients or referrals from one colleague to another were not sufficient as they were neither data or evidence based and did not provide the comparable information that patients and consumers needed, even if they did not yet know it.

It was the complexity of this data-based information requirement to bring the private sector up to NHS levels of performance information, that the Chair believed the whole private healthcare sector and PHIN had under-estimated as they embarked on delivery of the Order; although that complexity was actually no more than the processes used by organisations like GIRFT, NCIP and the CQC.

The PHIN website went live in April 2013, but the early years were largely spent consulting with Providers and consultant organisations, such as the Royal College of Surgeons on PROMs, just to get the definitions and standards agreed, in order to start meaningful data collection. Thereafter, it was about increasing the pace of delivery, engagement with 650 sites and over 11,000 identified consultants across the United Kingdom; collecting and assuring the quality of literally millions of bits of data with the objective of assuring the accuracy and reliability of the information on the website; which was essential for such a website.

The objective now needed to be about completing delivery of the Order. PHIN had consulted and brought forward a draft strategic plan with that aim at the Members’ meeting in July, but concerns were expressed, particularly about the proposed fee increase. Discussions to find a way forward were started through a Partnership Forum involving representatives from the five major Providers, supported by the IHPN. However, after a few meetings, discussions had got bogged down in detail and the parties accepted that little progress was being made. In the face of this impasse, PHIN



decided to remove the draft strategic plan from the agenda for today's meeting and to take the proposal for a fee increase off the table for the time being.

PHIN then initiated a round of bilateral meetings with major Providers to seek to understand the strategic issues of concern. A few key themes emerged, but discussions on these had not yet started, so it might take a while to achieve a consensus on a way to complete delivery of the CMA Order.

As a result, there was currently no plan on the table and, therefore, no target date for delivery of the CMA Order. Both the Board and the PHIN executive team had spent a lot of time on this and felt that, for now, they have done their part. All the Members have a part to play in getting the Order over the line for consumers and patients; PHIN will of course keep listening and talking but are now waiting to hear alternative proposals for discussion on how PHIN and its Members can work together to finally complete delivery of the Order.

The Chair stated that it had been a real privilege to serve for close to 10 years and was very proud of the progress that had been made despite the challenges. MJ and his team were totally committed to the enormous task in front of them and the Chair thanked them all for their support over that time. The Chair also thanked the members of the Board for their continued engagement and support for the all-important mission of delivering information to consumers and patients to help them make informed choices, that being PHIN's principal purpose.

David Hare, Chief Executive of IHPN, had felt he had to step down as the Provider nominee to the Board earlier in the year due to conflict of interest. The Chair and the Board were disappointed that there was not a supported strategic plan to put forward at the meeting, but hoped that progress towards a solution would continue over the coming months, and that this might enable David to return to the Board, if re-nominated.

The Chair extended his thanks to Jayne Scott, Deputy-Chair and longstanding Chair of the Board's Audit and Risk Committee. Jayne had been involved in the bilateral meetings seeking to understand the Provider position over the past few months. The Board had discussed the Chair's forthcoming retirement and decided that, with an obvious candidate already on the Board and to maintain continuity and stability, they would appoint Jayne Scott to the Chair.

The Chair confirmed that JS would formally take up the role of Chair at the next PHIN Board Meeting on 3 February 2022 at which time he would step down. The Chair congratulated JS on her appointment and invited her to address the attendees.

JS acknowledged the Chair's leadership and his unwavering commitment to patients and consumers and his focus on clinical outcomes. JS was delighted to be taking on the role of Chair and also acknowledged the significant support received from the PHIN Board and Executive Team and the support from the largest Provider members through the Partnership Forum. JS recognised the need to reset the agenda and relationship with Members and that it was both possible and essential to work together in partnership. It was vital that PHIN and its Members ensured there was a plan in place to deliver the Order.

The Chair explained the voting procedure and the following Ordinary Resolutions were proposed to the meeting:

**Resolution 1:**

To approve the Minutes of the Annual General Meeting held on 10 December 2020.

**Resolution 1 was carried unanimously.** There were no votes against and no abstentions

**Overview of Report and Accounts 2020-21**

Prior to moving to the second resolution, the Chair invited Jack Griffin, PHIN Finance & Commercial Director to speak.



JG confirmed that the detailed financial statements had been sent to Members in advance of the AGM.

JG summarised the audited financial statements for the year ended 31 July 2021. The Auditors had returned an unqualified audit opinion.

JG informed the attendees that the balance sheet demonstrated an improvement in PHIN's debt position due to combination of improved debt collection procedures and prompter payment from Members. This had enabled PHIN to release the majority of the bad debt provision by year end. At the end of the financial year, the reserves stood at 4.7 months operating expense cover against a governance target of 6 months and this would be addressed through the current year budget.

The Chair asked for questions and none were forthcoming

**Resolution 2:**

To receive the Company's annual accounts and reports of the Directors for the year ended 31<sup>st</sup> July 2021

**Resolution 2 was carried unanimously.** There were no votes against and no abstentions

**2021-22 Budget**

JG gave an overview of the budget position for the current year and noted that more detail had been given at the Members Meeting in July 2021

For the prior 3 years, PHIN had been investing in resources to support the delivery of the CMA Order but had deferred the decision to increase fees. The Board had agreed to reduce the reserves policy from 6 months operating expense cover to 5 months. JG concluded by noting that PHIN was on course to achieve the 5-month reserves target by the end of the year.

The Chair asked for questions and none were received.

**Announcements**

The Chair announced that Matt James, the co-founder and Chief Executive of PHIN had, at the November 2021 PHIN Board Meeting, asked the PHIN Board to begin a search for his successor. The Chair noted that it would inevitably take some time to find a successor and in the meantime, the Board had asked MJ to remain in post to help ensure a smooth succession and MJ had agreed to do so. The Chair clarified that this was not the formal resignation of a director but rather the start of a transition process.

There being no other business, **the Chair drew the formal business of the AGM to a close at 1.24pm.**

